



2017-2018

DISCUSSION PACKET

***The Movement of People:
How Mobility Has Impacted
Society and Culture***

Rachel Schott, Class A
Mike Worcester, Class AA

Minnesota State High School League
2100 Freeway Boulevard
Brooklyn Center, MN 55430-1735
www.mshsl.org

Overview of Discussion

“Problem-solving Discussion is an effort on the part of a small group to reach a solution to a problem through informal interchange of facts, inferences, and judgments. This method of discussion seeks consensus rather than majority rule. The focus of this event should be the encouragement of cooperation and critical thinking to arrive at the collective goal of better understanding and problem solving.” (MSHSL Rules and Policies Manual)

The purpose and goal of the category of Discussion is to help students learn critical thinking skills, what constitutes quality research, effective group communication tactics, and problem-solving techniques. Unlike other forensics activities which are adversarial in nature, Discussion emphasizes that participants utilize consensus building tools to accomplish their goals. Encouraging a thoughtful exchange of substantive information, positive group interactions, and full participation by all should be the goal of every coach, student, and judge involved in this category. Game-playing and confrontational verbal (or non-verbal) tactics should be dissuaded.

Overview of This Year’s Topic

Since the dawn of time, humans have been transient. We have moved and relocated and started anew for millennia. As the world has grown figuratively smaller, the stresses created by this movement have grown more amplified. Economic, cultural, and social factors have all combined to foster an environment of both uncertainty and opportunity. The goal of this year’s outline is to examine how these movements, both past and present, have impacted and continue to impact people and policy in a variety of ways.

TASK INFORMATION

Tasks at Invitational Tournaments

While the Minnesota State High School League does not limit the use of topic areas used for Discussion at invitational speech tournaments, the Discussion Committee recommends the following schedule to give students experience with all parts of the outline:

- **Start of Regular Invitational Season – February 17: Section Topics**
- **February 19 – Last Regular Season Invitational: Subsection Topics**
- **State Tournament Tasks – Students should be prepared for *both* areas of the outline.**

Tournament Managers Please Note: Whether or not you choose to follow the above schedule, it is vital that you communicate to your participating schools which part(s) of the outline you will use and how you will be organizing your Discussion rounds.

Tasks at Subsection and Section Tournaments

Tasks for subsection and section tournaments will follow the procedure instituted in the 2016 season – Tournaments will no longer receive a full slate of tasks from which to choose. Instead they will receive a set of four or five tasks for those tournaments. Those tasks will be date specific (unique to one or two sets of tournaments) and will not be repeated at other tournaments.

While the actual tasks may not be shared beforehand with teams competing at subsection or section tournaments, the specific outline sub-points used will be sent with the sets and should be communicated to all coaches in your sub or section. For example: “Our subsection tournament will use Area 1, Sub-points A, C, D, J.”

Tasks at State Tournament

State tournament tasks will follow the same procedure as previous seasons. Separate sets will be written for each day and chosen at random for each round of competition. Tasks will come from both areas of the outline.

2017 - 2018 MSHSL Discussion Topic Outline

The Movement of People: How Mobility Has Impacted Society and Culture

I. PEOPLE ISSUES (Section Topics)

- A. Refugees (process, destination countries, acceptance vs. rejection)
- B. Language barriers (education, requiring certain language skills, multi-lingualism)
- C. Cultural/religious clashes (adaptation, sharing, accommodation vs. assimilation)
- D. Documented vs. undocumented immigration (economic issues, crime concerns, removal vs. management)
- E. Movement for resources/opportunities (natural resources, economic opportunities, rural depopulation)
- F. Involuntary migration (slavery, trafficking, ethnic cleansing, return migration)
- G. Racial and economic-inspired migration (“white flight”, gentrification, clustering)
- H. Intraregional movement (EU, South America, East Asia, Africa)
- I. Demographic crises (aging populations, gender disparities, educational attainment)
- J. Temporary migration (snowbirds, seasonal/temporary workers, school year population shifts)

II. GOVERNMENT ISSUES (Subsection Topics)

- A. Refugees (procedures for accepting, sentiment vs. political reality)
- B. Resources (who is responsible, government vs. n.g.o.)
- C. Assuring human rights (economic exploitation, crime issues/perceptions)
- D. Border security (physical barriers, entry restriction factors, cost vs. outcomes)
- E. Travel (inter- and intra-national movement, safety and regulations, entry refusal)
- F. Commerce (skill levels, “brain drain”, geographic disparities)
- G. US Immigration Policy (what works, what does not work, path to citizenship)
- H. US Policy vs. Other Nations’ Policies (differences in philosophy and approach)
- I. Science and technology (tracking people, convenience of travel)
- J. Demographic considerations (gender, age, education and/or skill levels)

BIBLIOGRAPHY

The bibliography is intended as a starting point for researching this topic, with each sub-point having at least three citations. General interest web sites are listed at the end. It is not meant to be exhaustive and presents a fraction of the resources available to prepare for Discussion rounds. A source listed in one area may be applicable to other subtopic points.

I. PEOPLE ISSUES (Section Topic)

A. Refugees (process, destination countries, acceptance vs. rejection)

1. *The World's Movement of People -- In One Map*, World Economic Forum, 20 July 2016. <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2016/07/the-worlds-immigration-in-one-map/>.
2. U.S. Refugee Admissions Program FAQs, U.S. Department of State, 20 January 2017. <https://www.state.gov/j/prm/releases/factsheets/2017/266447.htm>
3. Economic Impact of Refugees, National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 5 July 2016. <http://www.pnas.org/content/113/27/7449.full>
4. "This map helps explain why some European countries reject refugees, and others love them." *The Washington Post*, 8 September 2015. https://www.washingtonpost.com/news/worldviews/wp/2015/09/08/this-map-helps-explain-why-some-european-countries-reject-refugees-and-others-love-them/?utm_term=.4848b3730cdb

B. Language Barriers (education, requiring certain language skills, multi-lingualism)

1. "What Would a World Without Language Barriers Look Like?", *The Atlantic*, 9 April 2015. <https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2015/04/what-would-a-world-without-language-barriers-look-like/390081/>
2. *Speaking for Ourselves*, Amherst Wilder Foundation, June 2016. (Specific to Minnesota but is a good starting point to understand language barriers), <http://www.wilder.org/Wilder-Research/Publications/Studies/Forms/Study/docsethomepage.aspx?ID=1518&RootFolder=%2FWilder-Research%2FPublications%2FStudies%2FSpeaking%20for%20Ourselves>
3. "NYC teacher helps immigrant kids overcome language barrier issues", *New York Daily News*, 13 June 2017. <http://www.nydailynews.com/new-york/education/nyc-teacher-helps-immigrant-kids-overcome-language-barrier-issues-article-1.3245592>
4. "International Migration: The impact of linguistic proximity on preferred destinations." VOX. 8 October 2015. <http://voxeu.org/article/language-and-migration>

C. Cultural/religious Clashes (adaptation, sharing, accommodation vs. assimilation, what kind of food analogy should we aspire towards?)

1. *Difference Between Assimilation and Acculturation* (a bit simple but a decent starting guide for the terms) <http://pediiaa.com/difference-between-assimilation-and-acculturation/>
2. "Analogies for America: Beyond The Melting Pot", *Minneapolis Star Tribune*, 29 June 2013. <http://www.startribune.com/analogies-for-america-beyond-the-melting-pot/213593491/>

3. "Migrant Crisis: Changing attitudes of a German city", BBC News, 28 April 2016.
<http://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-36148418>
- D. Documented vs. Undocumented Immigration (economic issues, crime concerns, removal vs. management)
1. *How Americans View Immigrants and What They Want From Immigration Reform*, Public Religion Research Institute, 29 March 2016. <https://www.prrri.org/research/poll-immigration-reform-views-on-immigrants/>
 2. *Unauthorized Immigrants Aren't Crime 'Bogeymen'*, CATO Institute, 28 March 2017, <https://www.cato.org/publications/commentary/unauthorized-immigrants-arent-crime-bogeymen>
 3. "Facts About Immigration and the U.S. Economy", Economic Policy Institute, <http://www.epi.org/publication/immigration-facts/>
 4. "DACA has shielded nearly 790,000 young undocumented immigrants from deportation." Pew Research Center, 1 September 2017.
<http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/09/01/unauthorized-immigrants-covered-by-daca-face-uncertain-future/>
- E. Movement for Resources/Opportunities (natural resources, economic opportunities, rural depopulation)
1. "The Graying of Rural America", *The Atlantic*, 2 June 2016.
<https://www.theatlantic.com/business/archive/2016/06/the-graying-of-rural-america/485159/>
 2. "A World Without Borders Makes Economic Sense", *The Guardian*, 5 September 2011.
<https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/poverty-matters/2011/sep/05/migration-increase-global-economy>
 3. *Movement of people across the landscape: a blurring of distinctions between areas, interests, and issues affecting natural resource management*, U. S. Forest Service, 2004. <https://www.nrs.fs.fed.us/pubs/3641>
 4. "States Try to Counter Rural Flight." The PEW Charitable Trusts. 20 August 2015.
<http://www.pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/blogs/stateline/2015/08/20/states-try-to-counter-rural-flight>
- F. Involuntary/Forced Migration (slavery, trafficking, ethnic cleansing, return migration)
1. "The Economic Impact of Forced Migration", Carnegie Endowment for International Peace, 22 April 2016. <http://carnegieendowment.org/2016/04/22/economic-impact-of-forced-migration-pub-63421>
 2. *Forced Migration*, Encyclopedia of Global Human Migration, 4 February 2013.
<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/9781444351071.wbeghm236/full?campaign=gms-193706>
 3. "Forced migration in the 21st century: urbanised and unending", *The Guardian*, 16 October 2012. <https://www.theguardian.com/global-development/2012/oct/16/forced-migration-21st-century-urbanised-unending>
 4. "America's first climate refugees." *The Guardian*, 13 May 2013
<https://www.theguardian.com/environment/interactive/2013/may/13/newtok-alaska-climate-change-refugees>

- G. Racial and Economic-Inspired Migration (“white flight”, gentrification, economic mobility.)
1. “How To Understand Gentrification”, *Forbes*, 29 August 2016.
<https://www.forbes.com/sites/petesaunders1/2016/08/29/understanding-gentrification/#5e2be5e835ec>
 2. “The Culprits Behind White Flight”, *New York Times*, 15 May 2017.
<https://www.nytimes.com/2017/05/15/opinion/white-flight.html?mcubz=3>
 3. “Why Doesn’t More of the Working Class Move for Jobs?”, *Harvard Business Review*, 18 May 2017. <https://hbr.org/ideacast/2017/05/why-doesnt-more-of-the-working-class-move-for-jobs>
 4. “Documenting decline in U.S. economic mobility”, *Science*, 24 April 2017.
<http://science.sciencemag.org/content/early/2017/04/21/science.aan3264.full>
- H. Intraregional Movement (EU, South America, East Asia, Africa)
1. “Voting with their feet? Why young Africans are choosing migration over the ballot box”, *World Economic Forum*, 11 July 2017.
<https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2017/07/the-biggest-cause-of-african-migration-might-not-be-what-you-think>
 2. Migrants’ New Paths Reshaping Latin America, *New York Times*, 5 January 2012.
<http://www.nytimes.com/2012/01/06/world/americas/migrants-new-paths-reshaping-latin-america.html?mcubz=3>
 3. *Free Movement in Europe: Past and Present*, Migration Policy Institute, 21 April 2011.
<http://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/free-movement-europe-past-and-present> (A bit dated but still a nice summary and starting point for EU issues.)
- I. Demographic Crises (aging populations, gender disparities, educational attainment)
1. “10 Countries On The Verge of a Crippling Demographic Crisis”, *Business Insider*, 22 February 2010. <http://www.businessinsider.com/10-countries-on-the-verge-of-a-demographic-crisis-2010-2?op=1/#rt-one-emerging-economies-with-out-of-control-population-growth-1>
 2. “U.S. Immigration Law Treats Women and Men Differently” *Huffington Post*, 5 June 2013, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2013/06/05/us-immigration-women_n_3390540.html
 3. “Intraregional Trade and Restrictions on the Movement of People”, *The Brookings Institute*, https://www.brookings.edu/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/01_intraregional_trade_kimenyi.pdf
- J. Temporary Migration (snowbirds, seasonal/guest workers, allowance for temporary foreign workers)
1. “Ageing as a migrant: vulnerabilities, agency and policy implications”, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 12 October 2016.
<http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/1369183X.2016.1238903>
 2. “H-2A Temporary Agricultural Workers”, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services,
<https://www.uscis.gov/working-united-states/temporary-workers/h-2a-temporary-agricultural-workers>
 3. “Snowbirds A Challenge for Health Care Industry”, *Pensacola News Journal*, 8 January 2017. <http://www.pnj.com/story/money/business/2017/01/08/snowbirds-challenge-health-care-industry/96171772/>

4. "What colleges do for local economies: A direct measure based on consumption", *Brookings Institution*, 17 November 2015. <https://www.brookings.edu/research/what-colleges-do-for-local-economies-a-direct-measure-based-on-consumption/>

II. GOVERNMENT ISSUES (Subsection Topics)

- A. Refugees (procedures for accepting, sentiment vs. political reality)
 1. "Refugees Entering the U.S. Already Face a Rigorous Vetting Process", *New York Times*, 29 January 2017. <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2017/01/29/us/refugee-vetting-process.html>
 2. *U. S. Refugee Admissions Program*, U. S. Department of State. <https://www.state.gov/j/prm/ra/admissions/>
 3. *U. S. Public Seldom Has Welcomed Refugees Into Country*, Pew Research Center, 19 November 2015. <http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2015/11/19/u-s-public-seldom-has-welcomed-refugees-into-country/>
 4. "Syrian refugee crisis: How different countries have responded", *Independent*, 1 September 2017. <http://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/politics/syrian-refugee-crisis-how-different-countries-have-responded-france-lebanon-uk-a7220616.html>
- B. Resources (who is responsible, government vs. n.g.o., trust in institutions?)
 1. *Human Rights Organizations*, <http://www.humanrights.com/voices-for-human-rights/human-rights-organizations/non-governmental.html>
 2. *Protection of Migrants' Rights and State Sovereignty*, *United Nations Chronicle*, September 2013. <https://unchronicle.un.org/article/protection-migrants-rights-and-state-sovereignty>
 3. "People's Trust Has Declined in Business, Media, Government, and NGOs", *Harvard Business Review*, 16 January 2016. <https://hbr.org/2017/01/survey-peoples-trust-has-declined-in-business-media-government-and-ngos>
 4. "Climate change is forcing people to migrate and the world doesn't have a plan to handle it", *Grist*, 30 October 2015. <http://grist.org/climate-energy/climate-change-is-forcing-people-to-migrate-and-the-world-doesnt-have-a-plan-to-handle-it/>
- C. Ensuring Human Rights (economic exploitation, crime issues/perceptions)
 1. *Perceptions, Minority Populations and Law Enforcement: A Two Way Problem*, *American Society For Public Administration*, 14 April 2017. <http://patimes.org/perceptions-minority-populations-law-enforcement-problem/>
 2. *Future Development Reads: Immigration and crime in the United States, Europe and Japan: What the research shows, what folks believe, and what governments should do*, *Brookings Institution*, 3 February 2017. <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/future-development/2017/02/03/future-development-reads-immigration-and-crime-in-the-united-states-europe-and-japan-what-the-research-shows-what-folks-believe-and-what-governments-should-do/>
 3. "The exploitation of migrants has become our way of life", *The Guardian*, 17 August 2015, <https://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2015/aug/17/exploitation-migrants-way-of-life-immigration-business-model>

- D. Border Security (physical barriers, entry restriction factors, cost vs. outcomes)
1. *The Cost of a Border Wall vs. the Cost of Illegal Immigration*, Center for Immigration Studies, 15 February 2017. <https://cis.org/Report/Cost-Border-Wall-vs-Cost-Illegal-Immigration>
 2. *US Has Long History of Restricting Immigrants*, Voice of America, 31 January 2017. <https://www.voanews.com/a/united-states-history-of-immigration-restrictions/3700234.html>
 3. *Borders and Walls: Do Barriers Deter Unauthorized Migration?*, Migration Policy Institute, 5 October 2016. <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/article/borders-and-walls-do-barriers-deter-unauthorized-migration>
 4. "Securing and Managing Our Borders", *Department of Homeland Security*. 10 March 2017. <https://www.dhs.gov/securing-and-managing-our-borders>
- E. Travel (inter/intra-nation movement, safety and regulations, entry refusal, right to travel)
1. "Denied Entry: Stories of refugees and immigrants barred from the U.S.", *Washington Post*, https://www.washingtonpost.com/denied-entry/?utm_term=.4a76fc4586c7
 2. "Freedom of movement under United States law", https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Freedom_of_movement_under_United_States_law
(This is a good summary of some of the relevant case law regarding the right to travel in the United States; it should be used as a reference tool and not cited as the source itself.)
 3. Kahn, Jeffrey. *Mrs. Shipley's Ghost: The Right to Travel and Terrorist Watch Lists*. University of Michigan Press, 2013. ISBN#0472035878, <http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.3998/mpub.813459>
 4. "States Scramble to Comply with Federal ID Law", *US News & World Report*, 18 May 2017. <https://www.usnews.com/news/politics/articles/2017-05-18/states-scramble-to-comply-with-federal-id-law>
- F. Commerce (skill levels, "brain drain", geographic disparities)
1. "Will We See a Devastating Brain Drain Hit America?" *Inc.*, 24 March 2017. <https://www.inc.com/paul-grossinger/will-we-see-a-devastating-brain-drain-hit-the-us.html>
 2. *Migration/Geographic Mobility*, U.S. Census Bureau. <https://www.census.gov/topics/population/migration.html>
 3. *Defining Skill: The Many Forms of Skilled Immigrant Labor*, American Immigration Council, November 2016. https://www.americanimmigrationcouncil.org/sites/default/files/research/defining_skill_the_many_forms_of_skilled_immigrant_labor.pdf
 4. "Analysis: Would the U.S. benefit from a merit-based immigration system?" *PBS NewsHour*. 3 August 2017 <http://www.pbs.org/newshour/making-sense/analysis-u-s-benefit-merit-based-immigration-system/>
- G. US Immigration Policy (what works, what does not, improvements?, path to citizenship)
1. *The U.S. Immigration Debate*, Council on Foreign Relations, 29 June 2017. <https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/us-immigration-debate-0>

2. *Immigration Policy That Works*, Committee for Economic Development.
<https://www.ced.org/reports/immigration>
 3. *Should the Government Allow Immigrants Who Are Here Illegally to Become US Citizens?*, ProCon.org (a brief primer on the “amnesty” debate).
<https://immigration.procon.org/view.answers.php?questionID=001362>
 4. “Frequently Asked Questions: Rescission of Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA)”, *Department of Homeland Security*, 5 September 2017.
<https://www.dhs.gov/news/2017/09/05/frequently-asked-questions-rescission-deferred-action-childhood-arrivals-daca>
- H. US Policy vs. Other Nations’ Policy (differences in philosophy and approach)
1. *For A Stark Contrast to U.S. Immigration Policy*, *Try Canada*, National Public Radio, 26 January 2017. <http://www.npr.org/sections/parallels/2017/01/26/511625609/for-a-stark-contrast-to-u-s-immigration-policy-try-canada>
 2. “For Immigrants, America Is Still More Welcoming Than Europe”, *New York Times*, 8 December 2015. <https://www.nytimes.com/2015/12/09/business/international/for-immigrants-america-is-still-more-welcoming-than-europe.html>
 3. *How America's Idea Of Illegal Immigration Doesn't Always Match Reality*, National Public Radio, 8 March 2017. <http://www.npr.org/sections/thetwo-way/2017/03/08/517561046/how-americas-idea-of-illegal-immigration-doesnt-always-match-reality>
 4. “Immigration points-based systems compared” BBC News, 1 June 2016.
<http://www.bbc.com/news/uk-politics-29594642>
- I. Science and Technology (tracking people, convenience of travel)
1. *Immigrations Officials use Technology to Track Illegal Immigrants*, *North Carolina Journal of Law & Technology*, 6 October 2016. <http://ncjolt.org/immigrations-officials-use-technology/>
 2. “Tracking Immigrants Like FedEx Packages Doesn’t Actually Make A Lot Of Sense”, *Huffington Post*, 1 September 2015. http://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/christie-tracking-immigrants-fedex_us_55e5e725e4b0b7a9633a6918
 3. *Facial recognition technology could be used to track visa-holders leaving the US*, *TechRepublic*, 19 April 2017. <http://www.techrepublic.com/article/facial-recognition-technology-could-be-used-to-track-visa-holders-leaving-the-us/>
 4. “How technology has transformed the travel industry”, *The Guardian*, 29 February 2016. <https://www.theguardian.com/media-network/2016/feb/29/technology-internet-transformed-travel-industry-airbnb>
- J. Demographic Considerations (gender, age, education and/or skill levels, political beliefs)
1. “Texas becoming a magnet for conservatives fleeing liberal states like California”, *MPR News*, 27 August 2017. <https://www.mprnews.org/story/2017/08/27/texas-becoming-a-magnet-for-conservatives-fleeing-liberal-states-like-california> (See also - Bishop, Bill. *The Big Sort: Why the Clustering of Like-Minded America is Tearing Us Apart*, 2004, ISBN#0547237723.)
 2. “Where Educated Millennials Are Moving”, *Forbes*, 12 January 2017.
<https://www.forbes.com/sites/petesaunder1/2017/01/12/where-educated-millennials-are-moving/#20dfcdc1d3cc>

3. "High-School Dropouts and College Grads Are Moving to Very Different Places", City Lab, 16 June 2014. <https://www.citylab.com/life/2014/06/high-school-dropouts-and-college-grads-are-moving-to-very-different-places/372065/>

Websites

- World Economic Forum, Global Governance, <https://www.weforum.org/agenda/archive/global-governance>
- Migration Policy Institute, <http://www.migrationpolicy.org/>
- The Annenberg Classroom - Critical Thinking Resources for Immigration (rates each listed site by political leanings). <http://www.annenbergclassroom.org/page/critical-thinking-resources-for-immigration>
- Migration Policy Centre (mostly attuned to European issues but can be a good source for international approaches to this topic). <http://www.migrationpolicycentre.eu/>
- Amnesty International - Refugees, Asylum-seekers, and Migrants. <https://www.amnesty.org/en/what-we-do/refugees-asylum-seekers-and-migrants/>
- Oxfam International - Refugee and Migrant Crisis <https://www.oxfam.org/en/emergencies/refugee-and-migrant-crisis>

=====

If coaches have any questions regarding outline content, feel free to contact us:

- Rachel Schott – rachelgschott@gmail.com
- Mike Worcester – mrmike55321@yahoo.com